Collaborative Governance for Child-Friendly Cities in Indonesia: Policy Analysis and Issues in Cirebon City, West Java

Siti Khumayah[1]*, Soleh Suryadi[2], Didi Turmudzi[3], Makbul Mansyur[4]

[1]EM: _siti.khumayah@ugj.ac.id_
[2]EM: _Soleh.suryadi@unpas.ac.id_
[3]EM: _didi.turmudzi@unpas.ac.id_
[4]EM: _makbul.mansyur.ac.id_

*Corresponding author: Siti Khumayah (siti.khumayah@ugj.ac.id)

Abstract

The Child-Friendly City Development Policy requires the planned, comprehensive, sustainable, and synergistic involvement of the government, community, mass media, business and academia. Therefore, collaborative governance is needed to make KLA implementation more productive, effective, and efficient. This study aims to describe and analyze the development of KLA with collaborative governance model in Cirebon City, where since the enactment of the Regional Regulation on the matter in 2017 until 2020, it only obtained the Madya predicate and in 2022 it went back to the Pratama predicate, out of five levels of KLA predicates, namely Pratama, Madya, Nindya, Utama and Kota Layak Anak. Another goal of this research is to analyze inhibiting factors and the appropriate collaboration model for KLA development. This research uses qualitative descriptive method with a case study approach. Through this method, the research object will be described in depth based on facts and data collected, which will reveal the effectiveness of collaborative governance and the appropriate collaboration model for KLA development. The results show that the collaborative governance of KLA development in Cirebon City is not effective, therefore, it has not obtained the predicate of a child-friendly city. None of the KLA assessment clusters have reached the maximum score, except for the basic welfare and health of children. In addition, collaborative governance of KLA development in Cirebon City is known to be ineffective and has not involved all stakeholders. The causes of ineffective KLA development in Cirebon City are administrative and institutional factors, such as the lack of data availability, the absence of partnership documentation and recording, the lack of KLA profiles, and the absence of new regional regulations regarding KLA. The other causes are weak collaboration among stakeholders, which is characterized by low commitment, lack of innovation, the absence of the Indonesian Child-Friendly Company Association (APSAI), and the lack of training and certification for the convention on children's rights. Another factor is the fulfillment of KLA assessment indicators, such as the lack of children's participation, the availability of child-friendly schools, the limited public facilities for children, the suboptimal implementation of smoke-free areas, the high stunting rate, and the suboptimal child-friendly media. Therefore, the pentahelix collaboration model in the integrative framework for collaborative governance is appropriate because all stakeholders can

collaborate as equal partners, from defining the problem, planning the program, to implementation. This research produces novelty about the importance of media involvement in collaborative governance because it can be an effective means for socialization and education about KLA development. On the other hand, the mass media, especially social media, can obstruct KLA development if its content is uncontrolled and contrary to child protection efforts.

Children in cities in Indonesia face complex problems and issues in various aspects of their lives. Some of these are: 1. Health: Children in cities in Indonesia have not achieved adequate access to healthcare services, such as vaccination, vitamin supplementation, and basic healthcare. Children in cities are also vulnerable to infectious diseases and pandemic threats; 2. Education: Children in cities in Indonesia still experience disparities in accessing quality education. Some may face difficulties in terms of finances and transportation access; 3. Recreation: Children in cities in Indonesia do not have sufficient space, facilities, and activities to develop their imagination, creativity, as well as social and emotional skills. This is related to high urbanization rates and a lack of green open spaces in cities; 4. Safety: Children in cities in Indonesia are still quite vulnerable to various forms of violence, sexual abuse, and exploitation. This is related to weaknesses in the supervision and protection systems.

In addressing these issues, collaborative governance becomes an important and urgent concept in improving the quality of life for children in cities. Through collaboration between the government, communities, industries, and non-profit organizations, we can ensure better and more equitable provision of services, spaces, facilities, and activities for children in cities. Such collaboration can also build strong supervision and protection systems and strengthen public policies that support children. Therefore, collaborative governance is considered an effective solution to improve the quality of life for children in cities in Indonesia.

Literatur review

Collaborative Governance

Chris Ansell and Allison Gash (2007): In their book "Collaborative Governance in Theory and Practice," they define collaborative governance as a cooperative process between government and non-governmental actors to solve public problems, enhance governance, and promote public value. They examine its emergence and evolution and also provide case studies to demonstrate the application of collaborative governance in practice.

Tina Nabatchi, Matt Leighninger, and Lucas Foust (2015): In their book "Public Participation for 21st Century Democracy," they explore the theory and practice of public participation in collaborative governance arrangements. They argue that public participation should be viewed as a central component of collaborative governance, and they provide guidance on how to design and implement effective public participation initiatives.

Mark Warren (2009): In his book "Democratic Theory and Practice," he suggests that collaborative governance is a practical way to realize democratic ideals in the context of complex policy challenges. He argues that it can be a means of enhancing deliberative democracy by fostering collaboration among diverse stakeholders, enabling them to identify shared problems and devise mutually accepted solutions.

Steven Rathgeb Smith and R. Karl Rainer (2006): In their book "Collaborative Public Management," they describe collaborative governance as a method for improving the effectiveness of public management by promoting

shared authority and responsibility between public and private actors. They argue that such collaboration can enhance the efficiency and effectiveness of public services and programs, and provide examples of successful collaborative governance initiatives in various policy areas.

David Lewis and Mark Lemon (2013): In their book "Collaboration for Sustainability and Innovation: A Role For Sustainability Driven by the Global South?" they examine the role of collaborative governance in promoting sustainable and innovation-driven development. They highlight the importance of collaboration in solving complex, interrelated social and environmental challenges and provide case studies from various countries in the Global South.

Overall, these scholars agree that collaborative governance is a promising approach to address complex public problems by bringing together diverse stakeholders, promoting shared decision-making, and enhancing the effectiveness of governance.

Furthermore, Bambang Widodo Umar (2008): In the book "Collaborative Governance: Concepts, Strategies, and Implementation," Bambang Widodo Umar explains that collaborative governance is a collaborative process among various actors in an effort to enhance public value and find the best solutions to a problem. In his book, he also outlines several important principles in collaborative governance, such as community participation, transparency, accountability, and sustainable financing.

Fitria Yusuf, Djamaludin Ancok, and Slamet Thohari (2014): In the book "Governance for Sustainable Development: Strengthening Policies and Enhancing Community Participation," the concept of collaborative governance becomes the main focus in integrating sustainable development with active participation of communities and other stakeholders. The authors describe the concept of collaborative governance and provide examples of its implementation in various sustainable development programs in Indonesia.

Riatu Qibthiyyah and Arijsa Mulyono (2019): In the book "Community Participation and Good Governance," the concept of collaborative governance is applied in the context of community participation in decision-making processes. The authors discuss how collaborative governance can build effective collaboration between the government, communities, and other decision-makers in addressing public issues.

Siti Herni Rochana (2018): In her book "Governance and the Role of Actors in Sustainable Cities," Siti Herni Rochana formulates the concept of collaborative governance as a cooperation that involves participation from various parties in realizing a sustainable and child-friendly city. The authors explain several principles and strategies for designing, implementing, and measuring the effectiveness of collaborative governance in the context of cities.

Diah Ayu Puspitarini and Siswo Pramono (2019): In the book "Governance for Public Policy," the concept of collaborative governance is discussed with a focus on strengthening cooperation among public, private, and community actors in efforts to improve the quality of public policy and public services. The authors explain several principles and procedures for designing, building, and fostering collaboration among actors in order to enhance the quality of life for communities in Indonesia This research utilizes a co-research approach by involving children as partners in developing child-friendly public spaces in the city of Dublin, Ireland. The aim is to examine the role of children as co-researchers in designing a more inclusive and child-friendly urban environment. The research methods employed include participatory observation, group interviews, and content analysis using photosensors. The research consists of four stages: data collection, data

analysis, identification of priority aspects, and project implementation.

The findings of this study indicate that children are capable of providing valuable contributions in perceiving the urban environment from different perspectives and identifying issues and solutions related to the development of child-friendly public spaces. Children also contribute to the process of selecting locations to be developed and provide suggestions regarding elements to be considered in the construction. The researchers discovered three categories of factors influencing children's participation in the process of developing public spaces: individual factors, situational factors, and institutional factors. The outcome of the project conducted is a recreational arena in the city park featuring original echoes and the presence of ponies. The research concludes that children's participation as co-researchers is crucial in obtaining diverse perspectives for designing a more inclusive and child-friendly urban environment. Children's involvement can also help foster a sense of ownership of public spaces and strengthen identity and social connections within the local community.

Kiarie, W. N., and Muigai, A. W. (2019). "Perception of Physical Environment and Children's Well-being in Githurai Sub-County, Kiambu County, Kenya." International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications, 9(8), 19-25.

The study conducted by Kiarie and Muigai (2019) aimed to evaluate children's perceptions of the physical environment and their well-being in Githurai Sub-County, Kiambu County, Kenya. The research employed a survey method, involving 150 children aged 10-14 years residing in the area. The findings of the study revealed a significant relationship between children's perceptions of their physical environment and their well-being. Children who perceived their physical environment as poor tended to have lower levels of well-being. The research also identified several factors influencing children's perceptions, such as safety, the availability of parks, transportation facilities, and the friendliness of the environment. This study highlights the importance of considering children's perspectives in better physical environment planning and identifying factors that affect children's perceptions to improve the quality of the environment and children's well-being. The research provides insights to urban planners worldwide on the significance of considering children's perspectives in the process of creating child-friendly cities.

Wahi, P. (2020). "Challenges and Opportunities in Developing Child-Friendly Cities in India: Case of Bhopal." International Journal of Innovative Research and Advanced Studies, 7(4), 132-139.

The study conducted by Wahi (2020) discusses the challenges and opportunities in developing child-friendly cities in India, specifically focusing on the city of Bhopal. The research was carried out through interviews with experts and stakeholders involved in the implementation of child-friendly city programs in Bhopal. The findings of the study indicate that the main challenges in developing child-friendly cities in India are the lack of coordination between institutions, limited participation of children and families in the planning process, and inadequate availability of resources. Additionally, there are constraints in terms of regulations and policies that do not fully support the efforts of developing child-friendly cities. However, there are opportunities that can be leveraged, such as active involvement from various community groups and local governments to promote child safety, education, and health through child-friendly city projects. This research provides valuable insights into the challenges and opportunities in developing child-friendly cities in India and can serve as a reference for the

development of similar programs in other cities.

Referring to child-friendly cities around the world, such as Copenhagen, Denmark, Tokyo, Japan, and Melbourne, Australia, it can be summarized that these cities are categorized as child-friendly cities due to their facilities, including playgrounds, public transportation with special seating for children, museums and attractions for children, libraries, safe and clean public spaces, green open spaces, facilities for mothers and children in shopping areas, restaurants with special menus for children, and restaurants that cater to children's needs. ept of Collaborative Governance for Child-Friendly Cities

Concept of Collaborative Governance for Child-Friendly Cities

The concept or framework of collaborative governance for child-friendly cities focuses on the collaboration between government, communities, industries, and non-profit organizations in creating cities that are more suitable for children. Some important aspects to consider in collaborative governance for child-friendly cities are as follows:

1. Cross-sector collaboration: Various sectors including government, communities, industries, and non-profit organizations need to collaborate in addressing issues faced by children in the city. This ensures the effectiveness and efficiency of implemented programs, as well as maintaining coherence among various public policies across related sectors.

2. Community participation: Community participation is crucial in determining the centrality of child-friendly city programs. Children and parents should be involved in decision-making processes and the implementation of urban development programs suitable for children.

3. Transparency and accountability: Decision-making processes and the implementation of child-friendly urban development programs should be transparent, open, and accountable. This ensures that funds, resources, and time allocated for the programs are appropriately used for their intended purposes.

4. Assessment and monitoring: Progress measurement in implementing child-friendly city programs should be conducted periodically and transparently to assess achievements and identify potential challenges within the programs.

5. Financing: Different forms of financing should be sought, including government funding, corporate funding, non-profit organization support, and research grants, and synergy should be established to create effective programs with significant impact.

6. Partnerships: Partnerships between government, communities, industries, and non-profit organizations are crucial in ensuring ongoing development of child-friendly cities. Collaborations should have long-term goals, and this model should be continuously developed and strengthened to improve the future of children in the city.

The concept of collaborative governance can be applied on a broader scale by fostering cooperation among government, communities, industries, and non-profit organizations in providing services that promote the development of child-friendly cities. These programs may include the development of healthcare facilities, education and economic opportunities, poverty alleviation, children's rights fulfillment, child monitoring and protection systems, environmental management, and the development of green open spaces. Through collaborative governance, cities in Indonesia can improve the conditions and quality of life for children, ensuring a better future. Research Methodology

Research Method Used The author employs a qualitative descriptive method with a case study approach. Through this method, the author provides an in-depth description of the research

object based on the facts and collected data in the form of words, as well as supporting data in the form of images and numerical data.

Qualitative research, according to Borg and Gall (as cited in Sugiyono, 2017:9), is "...a research method based on postpositivism philosophy, used to investigate natural conditions of the research object, where the researcher is the key instrument. It also utilizes data triangulation techniques, seeking the truth of specific information by using various data sources such as documents, archives, interview results, observations, or by interviewing multiple subjects believed to have different perspectives."

Qualitative methods involve gathering comprehensive data through in-depth interviews, observations, documentation, and Focus Group Discussions (FGDs). Data analysis in qualitative research includes data reduction, data display, verification, and drawing conclusions. Research that employs qualitative methods is a research procedure that generates descriptive data in the form of written or spoken words from individuals and actors that demonstrate observed behavior (Bogdan and Taylor in Moleong, 2009:4). This method aims to explore and understand the meanings attributed by individuals or groups to social or humanitarian issues.

The process of qualitative research involves crucial efforts such as posing questions, procedures, collecting specific data from informants, analyzing data inductively from specific themes to general themes, and interpreting the meaning of the data (Creswell, 2014:4).

Results and Discussion

Research Results

Development of Child-Friendly City in Cirebon City The future of children is the future of the nation. The regeneration and future of the nation depend on how the state, society, and families nurture and protect children. As potential future generations, children need to be protected and have their rights fulfilled so they can live, grow, and develop in a dignified and humane manner. Efforts to ensure child protection and rights fulfillment need to be conducted structurally through regulation, planning, and implementation of development, which in turn becomes a cultural value within society.

One form of the state's concern and responsibility towards child protection and rights fulfillment is the policy of developing Child-Friendly Districts/Cities (CFD), which was first launched by the Ministry of Women's Empowerment in 2005. The CFD policy is an effort by district/city governments to accelerate the implementation of the Convention on the Rights of the Child from a legal framework into child-friendly definitions, strategies, and development interventions such as policies, institutions, and child-friendly programs. The CFD policy continues to be refined through various regulations established by the government. The most recent regulation issued by the government regarding the CFD policy is Presidential Regulation Number 25 of 2021 concerning Child-Friendly District/City Policy, followed by the establishment of Minister of Women's Empowerment Regulation Number 12 of 2022 concerning the Implementation of Child-Friendly District/City.

The predicate received by Cirebon City in its first year of participating in the implementation of the CFD policy, namely in 2017, was in the Pratama category. From 2018 to 2020, the predicate increased to the Madya category. However, the CFD predicate of Cirebon City did not improve; in fact, in 2021, it decreased to the Pratama category again. Minister of Women's Empowerment Regulation Number 12 of 2022 requires a city to be designated as child-friendly if it can meet the criteria consisting of 24 substantive indicators of children's rights and institutional aspects grouped into the following clusters:

1. Institutional cluster
2. Cluster I: civil rights and freedoms
3. Cluster II: family environment and alternative care
4. Cluster III: basic health and well-being
5. Cluster IV: education, leisure activities, and cultural activities
6. Cluster V: special protection

There are nine key components contained within these six clusters, namely:

1. The existence of local regulations/policies related to the indicators
2. Percentage of budget allocated to achieving the indicators
3. Trained human resources in the Convention on the Rights of the Child
4. Involvement of child forums/child groups in policy formulation and implementation of indicator programs
5. Interagency partnerships in the development of indicator programs
6. Involvement of community institutions in program implementation and activities
7. Partnerships with the business sector in program implementation and activities
8. Partnerships with the media in program implementation and activities
9. Innovation to achieve indicators

Institutional Cluster The institutional cluster in the evaluation and assessment system as the basis for designating a city as child-friendly (CFD) covers three indicators: the existence of regulations or policies related to CFD, strengthening CFD institutions, and involvement of community institutions, mass media, and the business sector in child protection and rights fulfillment. The conditions of these three indicators in the development of CFD in Cirebon City can be explained as follows: 1) Existence of Local Regulations/ Policies regarding CFD, 2) Strengthening of CFD Institutions, 3) Roles of Community Institutions, Mass Media, and the Business Sector

Cluster of Civil Rights and Freedoms The cluster of civil rights and freedoms in the development of CFD includes three indicators: (1) registered and having a birth certificate for children, (2) availability of child-friendly information, and (3) institutionalization of child participation. The empirical reality observed by the author regarding these three indicators in the development of CFD in Cirebon City can be explained as follows: 1) Registered and Having a Birth Certificate for Children, 2) Availability of Child-Friendly Information, 3) Institutionalization of Child Participation

Cluster of Family Environment and Alternative Care The cluster of family environment and alternative care in the development of CFD covers five indicators: (1) prevention of child marriage, (2) strengthening the capacity of consultation institutions providing childcare services for parents/families, (3) holistic and integrative early childhood development (PAUD-HI), (4) standardization of alternative care institutions, and (5) availability of child-friendly infrastructure in public spaces. Based on the data and information gathered, the author can describe the empirical conditions of these five indicators in the development of CFD in Cirebon City as follows: 1) Prevention of Child Marriage, 2) Strengthening the Capacity of Consultation Institutions Providing Childcare Services for Parents/Families, 3) Holistic and Integrative Early Childhood Development, 4) Standardization of Alternative Care Institutions, 5) Availability of Child-Friendly Infrastructure in Public Spaces

Cluster of Basic Health and Well-being Basic health and well-being involve granting children the right to a decent standard of living, enabling their physical, mental, spiritual, moral, and social development. The cluster of basic health and well-being as one of the dimensions of CFD development includes: (1) childbirth in healthcare facilities, (2) nutritional status of

toddlers, (3) breastfeeding and feeding of children under 2 years old, (4) healthcare facilities with child-friendly services, (5) healthy environments, (6) availability of Smoke-Free Areas (KTR), and (7) compulsory 12-year education.

Cluster of Education, Utilization of Leisure Time, and Cultural Activities There are two indicators covered in the cluster of education, utilization of leisure time, and cultural activities: (1) child-friendly schools and (2) availability of facilities for child-friendly cultural, creative, and recreational activities. The conditions of these two indicators in Cirebon City can be explained as follows:

Cluster of Special Protection Law Number 35 of 2014 concerning Child Protection and Government Regulation Number 78 of 2021 concerning Special Protection for Children state that the government, local governments, and other state institutions have the obligation and responsibility to provide special protection for children. Special protection for children is also a cluster in the development of CFD, where the indicators representing this cluster include:

1.   Prevention in special protection
2.   Services for child victims of violence and exploitation
3.   Children freed from child labor and worst forms of child labor
4.   Services for child victims of pornography, drugs, and HIV/AIDS
5.   Services for child victims of disasters and conflicts
6.   Services for children with disabilities, minority groups,and isolation
7.   Services for children with deviant social behavior
8.   Resolution of cases involving children in conflict with the law through diversion (for offenders)
9.   Services for child victims of terrorism networks and addressing stigmatization resulting

from labeling related to their parents' conditions. Based on the author's observations, it is known that the number of cases of violence against children in Cirebon City is relatively high. Data available from DP3AP2KB (Child Protection and Empowerment Agency) of Cirebon City shows that in 2021, there were 28 reported cases of violence against children, while in the first semester of 2022, there were 17 cases. On the other hand, during the same period, a high number of cases of violence/crimes involving child perpetrators also occurred, resulting in the phenomenon of children facing the law (Children in Conflict with the Law - CICL). According to data released by the Cirebon City Police Resort, there were 20 cases in 2021 with a total of 56 suspects, and in the first semester of 2022, there were 10 cases with 12 suspects. Based on the description of the conditions regarding the fulfillment of the 5 clusters of Child-Friendly Local Administration (KLA) adopted from the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) above, it is known that Cirebon City is weak in several aspects, including:

1.   There is no active participation of children in the process of local development planning.
2.   Child-friendly schools or educational units (SRA) in each level in Cirebon City have not reached 25 percent.
3.   The Cirebon City government has not standardized various child-friendly facilities, such as Child-Friendly Information Centers (PISA) and Child-Friendly Playrooms (RBRA).
4.   Although there is a Local Regulation No. 8 of 2015 regarding Smoke-Free Areas (KTR), the supervision measures are not optimal. This is evident from the continued presence of cigarette advertisements and promotions, cigarette company sponsorships in various activities in Cirebon City, and other violations of the smoke-free regulation.
5.   The management of Child-Friendly

Information Media (ILA) is not optimal, such as the lack of age-filtered user data and the absence of content supervision.

6. The number of child-friendly neighborhoods has not reached 100 percent.

Stakeholders in Child-Friendly City Development in Cirebon City

The implementation of Child-Friendly Local Administration (KLA) development requires hard work and cooperation from all relevant stakeholders, both government and non-governmental organizations. Each stakeholder has a role according to their duties and authorities in realizing Cirebon City as a Child-Friendly City.

The results of observations and documentation conducted by the author indicate that the presence of KLA development stakeholders in Cirebon City is fundamentally regulated and governed by Regional Regulation No. 8 of 2017 concerning Child-Friendly Cities and Mayor's Decree No. 463.05/Kep.402-DPPPAPPKB/2021 concerning the Formation of the Task Force for the Development of Child-Friendly Cities in Cirebon City. Based on these local legal instruments, the stakeholders involved in the implementation of KLA development in Cirebon City can be presented as follows:

1. Government Stakeholders: Government stakeholders involved in KLA development include all Regional Apparatus Organizations (OPD) of Cirebon City, as well as several government institutions under ministries.

2. Non-Government Stakeholders: Non-government stakeholders involved in KLA development in Cirebon City can be classified into four groups as follows: Business Community, Academia, Practitioners and Community Organizations, Mass Media.

Roles and Collaboration of Stakeholders in Child-Friendly City Development in Cirebon City

The roles of each stakeholder in the development of a Child-Friendly City (KLA) in Cirebon City are essentially regulated through Mayor's Decree No. 463.05/Kep.402-DPPPAPPKB/2021. The existing stakeholders are grouped into working groups according to their expertise in the KLA clusters. Based on the data obtained, there are six working groups formed with the following roles and tasks:

1. Institutional Working Group
2. Civil Rights and Freedoms Fulfillment Working Group
3. Family Environment and Alternative Care Working Group
4. Basic Health and Well-being Working Group
5. Education, Leisure Time Utilization, and Cultural Activities Working Group
6. Special Protection Working Group

Dimensions of Collaborative Governance in Child-Friendly City Development in Cirebon City

Collaborative governance is essential to ensure the optimal implementation of Child-Friendly City (KLA) development policies and achieve optimal results. Data and information on collaborative governance of KLA development in Cirebon City in this study were obtained and collected based on the concept of the integrative framework for collaborative governance by Emerson and Nabatchi (2015). According to this concept, there are six dimensions that must be fulfilled for collaborative governance of a policy to produce optimal results: (1) system context, (2) drivers, (3) collaboration dynamics, (4) collaboration actions, (5) outcomes of collaboration actions, and (6) adaptation. Discussion

Implementation of Child-Friendly City Development in Cirebon City

The development of Child-Friendly Cities (CFC) is one of the manifestations of the state's commitment to ensuring child protection efforts and the fulfillment of children's rights, as well as a

commitment to implementing Law Number 35 of 2014 concerning Amendments to Law Number 23 of 2002 concerning Child Protection, particularly Article 21 paragraph (6), after Indonesia ratified the Convention on the Rights of the Child. Based on that, CFC development can be categorized as a public policy because it is a government choice to take or not take action, as stated by Dye (1992:2) who defines public policy as "whatever government chooses to do or not to do."

As a public policy, the development of CFC must be implemented so that its objectives can be achieved. According to Grindle (1990:8-12), policy implementation is an important process because no matter how good a policy is, if its implementation is not well prepared and planned, its intended goals will not be realized.

Public policies such as CFC development certainly involve many parties and interests. This condition causes the success of CFC development implementation to be greatly influenced by the policy content and context. In other words, CFC development in Cirebon City will be influenced by several aspects, including (1) affected interests; (2) types of benefits; (3) extent of desired change; (4) decision-making site; (5) program implementers; and (6) supporting resources (Grindle, 1990:8-12).

Due to the involvement of multiple parties, the implementation of CFC development requires a governance system that enables synergistic collaboration among all involved parties or stakeholders, known in public administration literature as collaborative governance. One concept of collaborative governance is proposed by Emerson and Nabatchi (2015), who offer the Integrative Framework for Collaborative Governance model.

The implementation of CFC development in Cirebon City, when viewed from the perspective of the Integrative Framework for Collaborative Governance, encompasses six dimensions: (1) system context; (2) drivers; (3) collaborative dynamics; (4) actions; (5) outcomes; and (6) adaptation. Based on the findings of this research summarized in the Collaborative Governance Matrix for CFC Development in Cirebon City (Table 4.5), these six dimensions can be explained as follows:

System Context of Collaborative Development of CFC in Cirebon City

Collaborative governance for the development of CFC as cross-organizational collaboration does not take place in a vacuum but evolves within a broad and dynamic system context. Within the system context, there are six aspects that will influence the dynamics and performance of collaborative governance, namely: (1) public service or resources condition; (2) policy and legal framework; (3) socioeconomic and cultural characteristics; (4) network characteristics; (5) political dynamics and power relations; and (6) history of conflict. a. Public services or resources condition

a.   Child-Friendly City (CFC) is a policy that demands the creation of an environment that can fulfill various needs of children, including social, cultural, economic, educational, and psychological aspects. Broadly speaking, it is known that Cirebon City has not fully been able to provide child-friendly public services. In terms of infrastructure, only the health facilities in Cirebon City meet the requirements to be considered child-friendly. In fact, one of the community health centers in this city, namely Kejaksan Community Health Center, received a national-level award as a child-friendly healthcare facility in 2019 (source: https://www.pikiran-rakyat.com). In rational collaboration, adequate resources are needed, which can come from each stakeholder, both government and non-government entities (Banga, 2018). Similarly, it is mentioned that resources for collaborative governance are not solely provided by the government but can also come

from the community, academia, and business/corporate sectors. Resources in a collaboration can include financial funding, allocation of time and roles, technical and administrative support for implementing activities, mentoring, expertise in collaboration analysis, field implementers, and specialized needs (Astuti, Warsono, and Rachim, 2020:86).

b.   Policy and legal framework
Essentially, the development of CFC in Cirebon City is an implementation of policies decided by the government. Therefore, the development of CFC is guided by a series of regulations regarding its implementation procedures and provisions for cross-sector collaboration. Some of the relevant regulations are: (1) Presidential Regulation Number 25 of 2021 concerning CFC Policy; (2) Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation Number 12 of 2022 concerning the Implementation of CFC; (3) Regional Regulation of Cirebon City Number 8 of 2017 concerning CFC.

c.   Socioeconomic and cultural characteristics People from different socioeconomic backgrounds will bring about cultural diversity, including different perspectives on the needs for child protection and the fulfillment of children's rights. Culture is a set of fundamental values that shape behavior (Djumara, 2020).

The rapid development of the economy in Cirebon City, along with the rapid advancement of digital communication technology, has undoubtedly influenced the social and cultural fabric of the local community. Easy access to media communication and information is even considered a contributing factor to the high incidence of violence against children in Cirebon City. This condition highlights the need for the implementation of CFC development, ensuring that socioeconomic progress does not lead to a culture of violence, particularly against children and, more importantly, within children

themselves.

d. Network characteristics
The development of CFC requires synergistic cooperation among government entities, parents, families, communities, community organizations, businesses, and the mass media. Collaboration among these parties is explicitly required within the framework of CFC policy.

1.   Presidential Regulation Number 25 of 2021, in Article 9 paragraphs (1) and (2), states that the community, mass media, and business world play a role in implementing CFC. The community's role is carried out by individuals, child protection institutions, social welfare institutions, community organizations, and educational institutions.

2.   Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation Number 12 of 2022, in Article 3, states that the implementation of CFC aims to enhance efforts in fulfilling children's rights and providing special protection for children, as well as promoting synergy and collaboration among all parties, including the community, business world, mass media, and children themselves, in implementing CFC.

3.   Cirebon City Regional Regulation Number 8 of 2017, in Article 3, states that the purpose of regulating CFC is to realize a shared commitment between the local government, parents, families, communities, community organizations, the business world, and the mass media in promoting development that prioritizes the rights, needs, and best interests of children. This aims to ensure that children grow up to be faithful and pious individuals, with noble character, good health, knowledge, skills, creativity, independence, and responsible citizens. Furthermore, in Article 19 paragraphs (1) and (2), it is mentioned that the local government forms a CFC Task Force through the Mayor's Decree, which serves as a coordinating body consisting of executive, legislative, and judicial representatives responsible for children, higher education

institutions, non-governmental organizations, youth organizations, the business world, parents, Although collaboration among stakeholders is important and has been established in existing regulations, research results indicate that this collaboration has not been optimally achieved in the development of CFC in Cirebon City. Collaboration is predominantly carried out by Local Government Agencies (OPD) within the Cirebon City government, while some institutions mentioned in the CFC Task Force tend to be passive and even absent during coordination meetings. However, networking or partnerships are crucial in collaborative governance as a means of exchanging information because partnerships are at the lowest level before cooperation, coordination, and culminate in collaboration (Junaidi, 2018). Nevertheless, collaborative governance heavily relies on partnerships, including involving local residents, community organizations, public and private sectors (Gibson, 2011).families, and religious/community figures, as well as a children's forum.

e. Political dynamic and power relations

A conducive political environment, especially regarding the transition of mayors and vice-mayors through the electoral mechanism (local elections), as well as the relationship between the executive branch (City Government) and the legislative branch (City Council), can be seen as a determining factor for the success of programs in Cirebon City, including the development of CFC. A harmonious relationship within the local government will greatly support the implementation of collaboration among stakeholders because political dynamics, marked by leadership changes, can affect the positions of stakeholders and determine the direction to be pursued together (Emerson, Nabatchi, and Balogh, 2011). Collaboration can also face failure due to a lack of innovative leadership in achieving complex and contradictory political goals.

Innovative leadership is demonstrated by leaders who can introduce various values and goals that can lead to positive outcomes. Collaboration will be hindered if the leader overseeing the collaboration is not innovative in achieving politically complex goals that may lead to conflict (Astuti, Warsono, and Rachim, 2020:94).

History of conflict

Research findings indicate that Cirebon City has not been able to attain the Child-Friendly City (KLA) designation despite implementing this policy since 2017. In fact, in 2022, there was a decline in the rating from Madya to Pratama. One of the causes for this is the suboptimal collaboration among the stakeholders who should be involved. The government has not been able to effectively involve private sector potentials and the mass media in the collaboration for CFC development. Even among government institutions, there is a lack of agreement, leading to a sense of operating independently. This condition can also arise due to conflicts of interest among the stakeholders. Conflict in collaboration arises from different goals and expectations of each stakeholder, divergent views on strategies, and efforts to protect or gain control over the collaboration (Astuti, Warsono, and Rachim, 2020:87). The presence of collaborative governance becomes crucial as one of its benefits is to reduce and prevent conflicts. On the other hand, differences in interests within a collaboration can also trigger conflicts, necessitating efforts to ensure that divergent interests among the stakeholders do not lead to conflicts (Keban, 2014).

Drivers of Collaboration in CFC Development in Cirebon City

The implementation of CFC development requires drivers to ensure the achievement of the established goal, which is to create a city that is suitable for children. In the integrative framework for collaborative governance (Emerson and

Nabatchi, 2015), drivers can include uncertainty, interdependence, consequential incentives that need to be provided, and initiating leadership.

a. Uncertainty Uncertainty in collaborative governance is closely related to the interdependence among stakeholders. Uncertainty is a major challenge in managing public issues. Collective uncertainty exists regarding how groups collaborate to solve problems (Emerson, Nabatchi, and Balogh, 2011). This interdependence ultimately creates uncertainty when stakeholders do not fulfill their expected roles. The CFC working groups that have been formed become less dynamic and do not work optimally, resulting in a lack of positive impact on the ongoing collaboration. This condition also applies to the collaboration in CFC development in Cirebon City, which is known to be characterized by a lack of commitment from regional leadership, particularly the Mayor, and the limited involvement of non-governmental stakeholders. Additionally, there is a lack of involvement from local government agencies, as not all Local Government Agencies (OPD) actively participate in the collaboration for CFC development.

b. Interdependence Collaborative governance thrives when there is interdependence, a condition where individuals and organizations cannot achieve something through their own efforts and capacities alone (Emerson, Nabatchi, and Balogh, 2011). Through collaborative governance, dynamic interdependence is created among stakeholders, including government, private sector, and the community, through coordination, facilitation, and improved governance processes. High levels of interdependence among stakeholders increase commitment to collaborate (Suwandi in Sari, 2014). It is important to emphasize that collaboration is a continuous and mutually beneficial cooperative process (Astuti, Warsono, and Rachim, 2020:78).

In the case of CFC development collaboration in Cirebon City, there are existing regulations that condition this interdependence. The regulations stipulate that CFC development must involve several stakeholders, including government, private sector (business world), community organizations, and the mass media. Although the government plays a major stakeholder role, the involvement of the private sector, community, and mass media is still necessary. This creates interdependence among stakeholders within the government as well as between the government and non-government stakeholders, particularly the community. In reality, the involvement of the private sector and the mass media in CFC development in Cirebon City has not been optimal and is not visible at all.

c. Consequential Incentive Incentives in a collaboration act as motivators for stakeholders to believe they will benefit equally from the collaboration, encouraging their involvement and active participation. These incentives can include resources, interests, and opportunities (Emerson, Nabatchi, and Balogh, 2011). The collaborative process strengthens when stakeholders perceive tangible benefits from collaboration. Therefore, collaborative governance is reinforced when the necessary requirements for its implementation are available (Ansell and Gash, 2007).

In the context of CFC development collaboration, especially in Cirebon City, incentives need to be provided to ensure optimal stakeholder roles and performance. For local government stakeholders, incentives can include the availability of resources, particularly financial resources. For non-government stakeholders, especially the business world, incentives can be in the form of branding that enhances the image of the involved companies.

d. Initiating Leadership Strong leadership, respected and trusted by all stakeholders, is crucial in collaboration to achieve success (Astuti, Warsono, and Rachim, 2020:77). This type of

leadership is essential in implementing government programs, including CFC development. Leadership refers to individuals who utilize their capacities to take initiative and help prepare resources to support collaboration (Emerson, Nabatchi, and Balogh, 2011).

In the context of CFC development collaboration in Cirebon City, the Mayor has delegated the authority to lead the CFC Task Force to the Secretary of the City. As the chairperson of the task force, the Secretary of the City must demonstrate initiative in carrying out their responsibilities to realize one of the missions of Cirebon City Government, which is to develop Cirebon City's resource quality to be competitive, cultured, and excellent in all fields. This mission, closely related to the CFC development policy, can be achieved through the fulfillment of children's rights and special protection for children as quality future generations without violence and discrimination.

Collaboration Actions

Collaboration actions are the follow-up and outcomes of ongoing collaboration dynamics. In the perspective of the integrative framework for collaborative governance, collaboration actions include at least three aspects: specific context action, responsibility action, and goals action (Emerson and Nabatchi, 2015:82). Based on research findings, the actual actions carried out in the process of CFC development collaboration in Cirebon City include:

a. Coordination meetings Coordination meetings in the context of CFC development collaboration aim to align the perceptions and understanding of all involved stakeholders so that they can fulfill their roles within their respective working groups. However, it is known that not all stakeholders, especially non-governmental parties, attend these coordination meetings, reflecting the lack of effective collaboration networks built for CFC development in Cirebon City.

b. Strengthening stakeholder roles and responsibilities In this regard, it is emphasized that CFC development is based on Cirebon City Regional Regulation No. 8 of 2017, while also referring to the new Ministry of Women Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation. One ongoing effort is to strengthen the role of non-governmental institutions, including the establishment of the Indonesian Child-Friendly Company Association (APSAI) in Cirebon City. Organizations like APSAI are needed to ensure the involvement of the private sector, allowing business actors in the city to have a platform to unite and fulfill their roles in CFC development.

c. Monitoring and evaluation Monitoring and evaluation activities in the implementation of CFC development in Cirebon City are conducted to ensure the alignment between the implementation of activities and the established plans. Evaluation includes two aspects: internal evaluations within departments and cluster score assessments for CFC. The evaluation results serve as a guide for each Local Government Agency in the preparation of the Budget Implementation Document (DPA) and for the development of plans for subsequent stages. The score assessment evaluation is conducted to determine the final score for each CFC cluster, as stipulated in the Ministry of Women Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation as the basis for determining Cirebon City's CFC predicate.

Outcomes of Collaboration Actions

The outcomes of collaborative actions are the results of the implemented actions (Emerson and Nabatchi, 2015:82). In the context of CFC development in Cirebon City, the expected outcomes are the realization of child protection, the fulfillment of children's rights, and the attainment of the city's child-friendly predicate.

Based on empirical research, it can be stated that the collaboration for CFC development in Cirebon City has not achieved optimal outcomes. In other words, the realization of CFC in Cirebon City as the ultimate result of CFC

development policy implementation has not been successful. This is based on two factors:

a. Cirebon City obtained the Pratama predicate in the first year of the CFC evaluation (2017), then improved to the Madya predicate from 2018 to 2021, but reverted to the Pratama predicate in 2022.

b. The existence of cases of violence against children or violence involving children, the lack of child-friendly public facilities, limited space for children's creativity, and weak partnerships in CFC development are still prevalent.

Adaptation

Although it may be less prominent, adaptation cannot be disregarded in the cycle of collaborative governance. Adaptation is needed when the outcomes of collaboration do not meet expectations, requiring adjustments, especially in the collaboration dynamic process. Adaptation can involve institutional adaptation, cooperation among stakeholders, and broader resource condition adaptation (Emerson and Nabatchi, 2015:85).

Regarding the outcomes of CFC development collaboration in Cirebon City that have not met expectations, the adaptation process is crucial. Some necessary adaptation steps in this regard include:

a. Designing and establishing more comprehensive local regulations on CFC development to meet the demands and align with the new Ministry of Women Empowerment and Child Protection Regulation.

b. Promptly strengthening the role of non-governmental stakeholders, especially the business world and the mass media.

c. Optimizing local resources and potential to support CFC development collaboration.

d. Enhancing advocacy and awareness of children's rights conventions, as well as promoting public participation in CFC development.

Conclusion

Based on the research findings presented in the previous chapter, the author draws several conclusions regarding the implementation of Child-Friendly City (CFC) development using the collaborative governance model in Cirebon City as follows:

1. The implementation of CFC development in Cirebon City has not been effective, as the city has not been able to achieve the predicate of a child-friendly city and has only obtained the Madya predicate, which later dropped to Pratama. Based on the evaluation score criteria for CFC, which includes seven assessment clusters, none of the clusters achieved the maximum score, except for the basic health and well-being cluster, which scored close to the maximum. It is known that in collaborative governance, in the system context dimension, CFC development in Cirebon City does not involve all stakeholders, especially non-governmental parties, along with their existing resources and potential. In the driver dimension, the collaboration places government institutions as the leader and leading sector, with communication only taking place among related Local Government Agencies (OPD), reflecting the dominance of government stakeholders. The dominance of government institutions becomes more apparent in the collaboration dynamic dimension, where problem definition and solution, deliberation, and program/activity determination are solely carried out by the local government, which does not accommodate the aspirations and interests of non-governmental parties, especially the business world and mass media.

2. There are factors that hinder the effectiveness of CFC development implementation in Cirebon City, including: a. Administrative and institutional factors, such as:

1. Lack of data availability, including child profiles and supporting data, as well as data on

the prevention and handling of Children in Need of Special Protection (AMPK);

2. Lack of documentation and recording of partnership arrangements;

3. Absence of a CFC profile as a basis for the preparation of the Regional Action Plan (RAD);

4. No new local regulations on CFC have been established. b. Weaknesses in collaboration among stakeholders, including:

5. Low commitment from stakeholders;

6. Lack of innovation capacity in the Cirebon City Government;

7. Absence of the Indonesian Child-Friendly Business Association (APSAI);

8. Insufficient training and certification on children's rights conventions. c. Factors related to the fulfillment of CFC assessment indicators:

9. Insufficient participation of children in the development of regional development plans, including CFC development;

10. Availability of child-friendly schools (SRA);

11. Limited public facilities for children;

12. Suboptimal implementation of No-Smoking Areas (KTR) provisions;

13. High prevalence of stunting among children under five;

14. Suboptimal management of Information for Children (ILA) media.

3. The pentahelix collaboration in the framework for collaborative governance is an appropriate model for CFC development. Through this model, all stakeholders can engage in equal partnership cooperation, allowing for the optimization of CFC development from problem definition, program/activity planning, to implementation. Furthermore, adjustments can be made if evaluation results indicate that the achieved outcomes do not align with desired or planned outcomes. The pentahelix collaboration also enables the optimal involvement of mass media as it is an effective means for socializing and educating about CFC, including through social media.

Reference

Agranoff, Robert and Michael McGuire, 2003, *Collaborative Public Management: New Strategies for Local Governments*, Washington D.C.: Georgetown University Press

Agustino, Leo, 2008, *Dasar-dasar Kebijakan Publik*, Bandung: Alfabeta

Anderson, James E., 1984, *Public Policy Making, an Introduction*, Boston: Miftlin

Ansell, C. dan Gash, A., 2007, *Collaborative Governance in Theory and Practice*, Berkeley: Oxford Unversity Press

Astuti, Retno Sunu, Hardi Warsono, dan Abd. Rachim, 2020, *Collaborative Governance dala*

Perspektif Administrasi Publik, Semarang: DAP-FISIP UNDIP Press

Alter, Catherine, 1993, *Organizations Working Together*, Newbury Park: Calif

Bambang Widodo Umar (2008): *Collaborative Governance: Konsep, Strategi, dan Implementasi*

Banga,Wempy, 2018, *Kajian Administrasi Publik Kontemporer*, Yogyakarta: Gava Media

Barata, Mariam F., 2016, *Kebijakan Kominfo dalam Pemberitaan Anak*, Jakarta: Kemeninfo dan Smeru Reseacrch Institute.

Bevir, Mark, 2011, *The Sage Handbook of Governance,* London: Sage Publications

Carr, C.T. dan Hayes, R.A., 2015, *Social Media: Defining, Developing, and Divining*, Atlantic Journal of Communication, 23(1). doi: 10.1080/15456870.2015.972282

Cooper, P.J., 1998, *Public Administration for The Twenty-first Century*, Florida: Harcourt Brace.

Creswell, John W, 2014, *Penelitian Kualitatif dan Desain Riset*, Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar

Chris Ansell and Allison Gash (2007): *Collaborative Governance in Theory and Practice*,

David Lewis and Mark Lemon (2013): *Collaboration for Sustainability and Innovation:*

A Role For Sustainability Driven by the Global South

Denhardt, Janet V. dan Robert B. Denhardt, 2003, *The New Public Service: Serving, Not Steering*, New York: M.E. Sharpe

Diah Ayu Puspitarini dan Siswo Pramono (2019): *Governance untuk Kebijakan Publik*

Dimock, Marshal Edward dan Gladys Ogden Dimock, 1993, *Administrasi Negara*, Jakarta: Rineka Cipta

Dunn, William N., 1999, *Analisis Kebijakan Publik*, Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press

Dye, Thomas R., 1992, *Understanding Public Policy*, New Jersey: Prentice Hall

Edward III, George C., 1980, *Implementing Public Policy*, Washington DC: Congressional Quartely Press

Effendy, Onong Uchjana, 2001, *Ilmu Komunikasi Teori dan Praktek*, Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya

Emerson, Kirk dan Tina Nabatchi, 2015, *Collaborative Governance Regimes*, Washington DC: Georgetown University Press.

Emerson, Kirk, Tina Nabatchi dan Stephen Balogh, 2011, *An Integrative Framework for Collaborative Governance*, Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory, May, Vol. 22:1-29

Eppel, Elizabeth, 2013, *Collaborative Governance: Framing New Zealand Practice*, Working Paper No. 13/02, Institute for Governance and Policy Studies, Victoria University of Wellington

Elizabeth, Andriani dan Zainal Hidayat, 2016, *Implementasi Program Kota Layak Anak dalam Upaya Pemenuhan Hak-hak Anak di Kota Bekasi*, Journal Of Public Policy And Management Review

Fitria Yusuf, Djamaludin Ancok, dan Slamet Thohari (2014): *Governance for Sustainable Development: Memperkuat Kebijakan dan Meningkatkan Partisipasi Masyarakat*

Garna, Judistira K., 2009, *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*, Bandung: Primaco Akademika

Grindle, Merilee S., 1990, *Politics and Policy Implementation in the Third World*, New Jersey: Princeton University Press

Goggin, Malcolm L., 1990, *Implementation, Theory and Practice: Toward a Third Generation*, USA: Scott, Foresmann and Company

Gulick, Luther dan L. Urwick, 1937, *Papers On The Science Of Administration*, New York: The Rumford Press

Haque, M. A., dan Huang, Q. (2021). *Evaluating Child-friendly Cities Indicators: A Comparative Study of Dhaka and Beijing.* Journal of Urban Planning and Development, 147(3).

Irwin, M., Hendry, L., dan Perry, B. (2018). *Children as Co-Researchers in the Development of Child-Friendly Public Spaces in a Rapidly Changing City: A Case Study in Dublin, Ireland.* Journal of Urban Design, 23(1), 136-156.

Islamy, M. Irfan, 2009, *Prinsip-prinsip Perumusan Kebijakan Negara*, Jakarta: Bumi Aksara

Keban, Yeremias T., 2014, *Enam Dimensi Strategis Administrasi Publik: Konsep, Teori, dan Isu*, Yogyakarta: Gava Media

Kiarie, W. N., dan Muigai, A. W. (2019). *Perception of Physical Environment and Children's Well-being in Githurai Sub-County, Kiambu County, Kenya.* International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications, 9(8), 19-25.

Kurniadi dan Soleh Suryadi, 2021, *Collaborative Governance: Teori dan Implementasi*, Banyumas: Pena Persada

Luciana, Riama S., 2004, *Radio sebagai Medium Informasi*, Jakarta: UI

Maksudi, Beddy Iriawan, 2017, *Dasar-dasar Administrasi Publik: dari Klasik ke Kontemporer*, Depok: Rajawali Pers

Maslow, Abraham H., 2013, *Motivasi dan Kepribadian (Teori Motivasi dengan*

Pendekatan Hierarki Kebutuhan Manusia), Jakarta, PT. PBP

Mazmanian, Daniel H. dan Paul A. Sabatier, 1983, *Implementation and Public Policy*, New York: HarperCollins.

Mohr, J., dan Spekman, R., 1994, *Characteristics of Partnership Success: Partnership Attributes, Communication Behavior, and Conflict Resolution Techniques*, Strategic Management Journal, 15 (2), 135

Moleong, Lexy J., 2009, *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*, Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya

Morse, R.S. dan Stephen, J.B., 2012, *Teaching Collaborative Governance: Phases, Competencies, and Case-Based Learning*, Journal of Public Affairs Education, 18(3), 565–583

Mulyana, Deddy, 2008, *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*, Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya

Nugroho, Riant, 2003, *Kebijakan Publik: Formulasi, Implementasi dan Evaluasi*, Jakarta: Elek Media Kompotindo

Osborne, David dan Ted Gaebler, 1992, *Reinventing Government: How The Entrepreneur Spirit is Transforming The Public Service*, Jakarta Pustaka Binaman Pressindo

Pasolong, Harbani, 2010, *Teori Administrasi Publik*, Bandung: Alfabeta

Purwanti, Nurul D., 2016, *Collaborative Governance (Kebijakan Publik dan Pemerintahan Kolaboratif, Isu-Isu Kontemporer)*, Yogyakarta: Center for Policy & Management Studies FISIPOL UGM

Putra, Fadillah, 2001, *Paradigma Kritis dalam Studi Kebijakan Publik: Perubahan dan Inovasi Kebijakan Publik dan Ruang Partisipasi Masyarakat dalam Proses Kebijakan Publik*, Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar

Rewansyah, Asmawi, 2012, *Reformasi Birokrasi dalam Rangka Good Governance*, Jakarta: Yusiantanas Prima

Riatu Qibthiyyah dan Arijsa Mulyono (2019): *Dalam buku Partisipasi Masyarakat dan Good Governance*

Robbins, Stephen P., 2009, *Manajemen*, Jakarta: Penerbit Erlangga

Rusli, Budiman, 2015, *Kebijakan Publik*, Bandung: Adoya Mitra Sejahtera

Santrock, J.W., 2012, *Life Span Development: Perkembangan Masa Hidup*, Jakarta: Penerbit Erlangga

Sekaran, Uma, 1999, *Research Methods for Business*, Southern Illionis University

Shergold, P., 2008, *Governing Through Collaboration*, dalam O'Flynn, Janine dan John Wanna, *Collaborative Governance A New Era of Public Policy in Australia*, Canberra: Australian National University Press

Silalahi, Ulbert, 1992, *Studi tentang Ilmu Administrasi: Konsep, Teori dan Dimensi*, Bandung: Sinar Baru AlgesindoSturesson, E., Lindmark, A., dan Roos, M. N., 2009, *Collaboration for Innovation - A Study in the Öresund Region*, Lund University Libraries

Siti Herni Rochana (2018). *Governance dan Peran Aktor dalam Keberlanjutan Kota*

Steven Rathgeb Smith and R. Karl Rainer (2006): *Collaborative Public Management*

Mark Warren (2009). *Democratic Theory and Practice,*

Stoner, James A.F. dan Charles Wankel, 1986, *Management*, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall International, Inc.

Sugandha, Dann, 1991, *Administrasi: Strategi, Taktik dan Teknik Penciptaan Efisiensi*, Jakarta: Intermedia

Sugiyono, 2017, *Memahami Penelitian Kualitatif*, Bandung: Alfabeta

Sutopo, 2008, *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*, Surakarta: UNS.

Syafi'i, Inu Kencana, 2003, *Ilmu Administrasi Publik*, Jakarta: Rineka Cipta

Syafrudin, Ateng, 1993, *Pengaturan Koordinasi Pemerintahan di Daerah*, Bandung: Citra Aditya Bakti

Tachjan, 2006, *Implementasi Kebijakan Publik*, Bandung: AIPI dan Puslit KP2W Lemlit

Unpad

Tina Nabatchi, Matt Leighninger, and Lucas Foust (2015 *Public Participation for 21st Century Democracy,*

Thoha, Miftah, 2003, *Dimensi-Dimensi Prima Ilmu Administrasi Negara,* Jakarta: RajaGrafindo Persada

Thompson, Graham dan Christoff Pforr, 2015, *Policy Network and Good Governance: A Discussion,* Working Paper Series, Curtin University of Technology School of Management

Udoji, Chief J.O., 1981, *The African Public Servant As Public Policy in Africa,* Addis Abeba: African Association For Public Administration and Management

Van Meter, Donal dan Van Horn, Carl E., 1975, *The Policy Implementation Process Conceptual Frame Work.* Journal Administration and Society.

Vivian, John, 2008, *Teori Komunikasi Massa,* Jakarta: Prenada Media Group

Wahab, Solichin Abdul, 2008, *Analisis Kebijaksanaan: dari Formulasi ke Implementasi Kebijaksanaan Negara,* Jakarta: Bumi Aksara

Wahi, P. (2020). *Challenges and Opportunities in Developing Child-Friendly Cities in India: Case of Bhopal.* International Journal of Innovative Research and Advanced Studies, 7(4), 132-139.

Waldo, Dwight, 1991, *Pengantar Studi Public Administration,* Jakarta: Radar Jaya Offset

Wanna, John, 2008, *Collaborative Government: Meanings, Dimensions, Drivers, and Outcomes,* dalam O'Flynn. Jannie dalam John Wanna, *Collaborative Governance: A New Era Of Public Policy in Australia,* Canberra: Australian National University Press

Warsono, Sony, 2009, *Corporate Governance Concept and Model,* Yogyakarta: Center Of Good Corporate Governance

Winarno, Budi, 2014, *Kebijakan Publik, Teori, Proses dan Studi Kasus,* Yogyakarta: CAPS

Harianti, Puput, Barlian Barlian, dan Eka Suaib, 2020, *Analisis Implementasi Kebijakan Kota Layak Anak di Kota Kendari,* Publica, Jurnal Administrasi Pembangunan dan Kebijakan Publik

Haque, M. A. dan Huang, Q., 2021, *Evaluating Child-friendly Cities Indicators: A Comparative Study of Dhaka and Beijing,* Journal of Urban Planning and Development, 147(3), 04021009

Hidayat, M. Taufik, 2020, *Collaborative Governance dalam Program Tanggung Jawab Sosial dan Lingkungan Perusahaan di Kota Cirebon,*

Irwin, M., Hendry, L., dan Perry, B., 2018, *Children as Co-Researchers in the Development of Child-Friendly Public Spaces in a Rapidly Changing City: A Case Study in Dublin, Ireland,* Journal of Urban Design, 23(1), 136-156

Junaidi, 2018, *Collaborative Governance dalam Upaya Menyelesaikan Krisis Listrik di Kota Tanjungpinang,* FISIP UMRAH

Kiarie, W.N. dan Muigai, A.W., 2019, *Perception of Physical Environment and Children's Well-being in Githurai Sub-County, Kiambu County, Kenya,* International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications, 9(8), 19-25

Mahendra, Gerry Katon, 2017, *Analisis Implementasi Kebijakan Kota Layak Anak Bidang Kesehatan Ramah Anak,* Journal of Health Studies

Muqorrobin, M., 2016, *Proses Collaborative Governance dalam Bidang Kesehatan (Studi Deskriptif dalam Pelaksanaan Kolaborasi Pengendalian Penyakit TB-HIV di Kabupaten Blitar),*

Wahi, P., 2020, *Challenges and Opportunities in Developing Child-Friendly Cities in India: Case of Bhopal,* International Journal of Innovative Research and Advanced Studies, 7(4), 132-139

Zajac, E., dan Koncewicz-Hudyma, G., 2016, *Child-Friendly Cities: A Concept of Children's Participation in Urban Planning,* ARENA

Journal of Architectural Research, 1(2), 57-62

Legislation

Undang-Undang Nomor 4 Tahun 1979 tentang Kesejahteraan Anak

Undang-Undang Nomor 39 Tahun 1999 tentang Hak Asasi Manusia

Undang-Undang Nomor 35 Tahun 2014 tentang Perubahan atas Undang-Undang Nomor 23 Tahun 2002 tentang Perlindungan Anak

Undang-Undang Nomor 22 Tahun 1999 dengan beberapa kali perubahannya dan yang terakhir Undang-Undang Nomor 9 Tahun 2015 tentang Pemerintahan Daerah

Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 38 Tahun 2007 tentang Pembagian Urusan Pemerintahan antara Pemerintah Pusat, Pemerintah Provinsi dan Daerah Kota/Kabupaten